arXiv:math/0106252v2 [math.OA] 6 Jul 2001

A prime C*-algebra that is not primitive

Nik Weaver*

We construct a non-separable C-algebra that is prime but not primitive.*

A C*-algebra is *prime* if the intersection of any two nonzero (closed, two-sided) ideals is nonzero. It is *primitive* if there exists a faithful irreducible representation.

It is fairly easy to see that any primitive C*-algebra must be prime. Conversely, following a related result of Kaplansky [2], Dixmier [1] showed that every separable prime C*-algebra is primitive. The question whether, indeed, every prime C*-algebra is primitive has remained open. We answer this question negatively by more or less explicitly constructing a counterexample.

The basic idea is this. Our C*-algebra $\mathcal{A}$ is generated by a family of commuting projections together with a family of partial isometries which link selected projections. $\mathcal{A}$ is prime because any nonzero ideal contains a projection and any two projections lie above a pair of projections which are linked by a partial isometry. $\mathcal{A}$ is not primitive because every state on $\mathcal{A}$ vanishes on the ideal generated by some projection — and thus no irreducible representation, indeed no cyclic representation, can be faithful. Thus, $\mathcal{A}$ is prime but not primitive. The two conditions place competing demands on the set of partial isometries: it must be sufficiently abundant to verify the first claim and sufficiently sparse to verify the second. The demands are met simultaneously by selecting the set of partial isometries via a process of transfinite induction.

I wish to thank Charles Akemann for help and encouragement.

1. The construction

We adopt the conventions that $\mathbf{N} = \{1, 2, 3, \ldots\}$, that $\mathbf{R}^n = \{a : \{1, \ldots, n\} \to \mathbf{R}\}$, and that $2^{\aleph_0}$ is the smallest ordinal of cardinality $2^{\aleph_0}$. Let X be the set of all sequences of real numbers, i.e., $X = \{x : \mathbf{N} \to \mathbf{R}\}$. Give X counting measure and let $H = l^2(X)$. The C*-algebra we construct will be naturally represented on H.

For each $a \in \mathbf{R}^n$ define

$$X_a = \{x \in X : x(i) = a(i) \text{ for } 1 \le i \le n\}$$

and let $P_a \in B(H)$ be the orthogonal projection onto $l^2(X_a) \subset l^2(X)$. Define

$$\mathcal{U}_n = \{P_a : a \in \mathbf{R}^n\}$$

---

* Supported by NSF grant DMS-0070634

Math Subject Classification numbers: 46L05, 16G99

and $\mathcal{U} = \bigcup \mathcal{U}_n$.

Next, for any $n \in \mathbf{N}$ and any $a, b \in \mathbf{R}^n$, define a bijection $f_{a,b} : X_b \to X_a$ by

$$f_{a,b}(x)(i) = \begin{cases} a(i) & \text{if } i \leq n \\ x(i) & \text{if } i > n \end{cases}$$

for $x \in X_b$ and $i \in \mathbf{N}$. Observe that any sequence in X_b contains the n-tuple b as an initial segment and $f_{a,b}$ simply replaces this initial segment with a. Since $f_{a,b}$ is a bijection, composition with $f_{a,b}$ defines an isometry from $l^2(X_a)$ onto $l^2(X_b)$. Thus let $V_{a,b} \in B(H)$ be the partial isometry with domain projection P_a and range projection P_b defined by composition with $f_{a,b}$ on X_a.

The following observations will be useful in the sequel. For any $P_a, P_b \in \mathcal{U}$, if a is an extension of b then $P_a \leq P_b$, while if neither a extends b nor b extends a then $P_a P_b = 0$. Also, $P_a = V_{a,a}$. Lastly, an easy induction shows that any finite product of partial isometries of the form $V_{a,b}$ is again a partial isometry of the form $V_{a,b}$, even if the different factors involve tuples of different lengths.

Let $\mathcal{W}_1 = \mathcal{U} \times \mathcal{U}$ and let $\mathcal{W}_2 = \{Z \subset \mathcal{U} : Z \text{ is countable}\}$. By standard set theory, $\mathcal{U}$, $\mathcal{W}_1$, and $\mathcal{W}_2$ all have cardinality $2^{\aleph_0}$. Thus, there exist bijections $\phi_i : 2^{\aleph_0} \to \mathcal{W}_i$ ($i = 1, 2$). Fix such bijections ϕ_1 and ϕ_2. We now construct a transfinite sequence of natural numbers (n_σ) and two transfinite sequences of tuples (a_σ) and (b_σ), all for $\sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}$, with the following properties:

(i) $a_\sigma, b_\sigma \in \mathbf{R}^{n_\sigma}$,
(ii) if $\phi_1(\sigma) = (P_a, P_b)$ then a_σ and b_σ properly extend a and b, respectively, and
(iii) $a_\sigma(n_\sigma), b_\sigma(n_\sigma) \notin R_\sigma = S_\sigma \cup T_\sigma$ where

$$S_\sigma = \{a_\tau(n_\sigma), b_\tau(n_\sigma) : \tau < \sigma \text{ and } n_\sigma \leq n_\tau\}$$
$$T_\sigma = \{P_c(n_\sigma) : c \in \phi_2(\tau) \text{ for some } \tau < \sigma \text{ and } n_\sigma \leq \text{length}(c)\}$$

for all $\sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}$. The construction proceeds by transfinite induction. Fix $\sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}$ and suppose a_τ and b_τ are defined for all $\tau < \sigma$. Say $\phi_1(\sigma) = (P_a, P_b)$. Let n_a and n_b be the lengths of a and b, respectively, and let $n_\sigma = \max(n_a, n_b) + 1$. Then define R_σ, S_σ, and T_σ as in condition (iii) above. Both S_σ and T_σ are subsets of $\mathbf{R}$ of cardinality strictly less than $2^{\aleph_0}$, so we can find $r \in \mathbf{R}$ not in $R_\sigma = S_\sigma \cup T_\sigma$. Let a_σ and b_σ be n_σ-tuples which extend a and b, respectively, and satisfy $a_\sigma(n_\sigma) = b_\sigma(n_\sigma) = r$. This completes the definition of n_σ, a_σ, and b_σ.

For any $\sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}$ define $V_\sigma = V_{a_\sigma, b_\sigma}$; then let $\mathcal{V} = \{V_\sigma : \sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}\}$. Let $\mathcal{A}$ be the C*-algebra generated by $\mathcal{U}$ and $\mathcal{V}$.

This completes the construction. Although a few arbitrary choices were made, if one wanted to make the construction more concrete a definite rule could be given for each choice, modulo the identification of $2^{\aleph_0}$ with an ordinal. Also note that although $\mathcal{A}$ is nonunital, we could give it a unit by defining $\mathcal{U}_0 = \{I\}$ and letting $\mathcal{U} = \bigcup_{n \geq 0} \mathcal{U}_n$. This would not affect any part of our argument in Section 2.

2. Proof of the result

Retain the notation of the preceding section.

Lemma 1. *The C*-algebra $\mathcal{A}$ is prime.*

Proof. For any $B \in \mathcal{A}$ let g_B be the function on X defined by $g_B(x) = \langle B\chi_x, \chi_x\rangle$, where $\chi_x \in H$ is the characteristic function of x.

Let $\mathcal{I}$ be a nonzero closed, two-sided ideal of $\mathcal{A}$. Then $\mathcal{I}$ contains a nonzero positive operator A. Since $\mathcal{A}$ is generated by $\mathcal{U}$ and $\mathcal{V}$, A is approximated by a sequence of $*$-polynomials in elements of $\mathcal{U}$ and $\mathcal{V}$, which means that A is in the C*-subalgebra generated by a countable subset $\mathcal{Q}$ of $\mathcal{U} \cup \mathcal{V}$.

Since $A > 0$, there exists $x \in X$ such that $g_A(x) > 0$. Fix such an x. Then let B be a $*$-polynomial in elements of $\mathcal{Q}$ such that $\|B - A\| < g_A(x)/2$. This implies that $\|g_B - g_A\|_\infty < g_A(x)/2$, which in particular yields $|g_B(x)| > g_A(x)/2$.

Now B is a $*$-polynomial in a finite number of elements $B_i \in \mathcal{Q}$, so we can find $n \in \mathbf{N}$ which strictly exceeds the length of any tuple a such that $B_i = P_a$ for some i, as well as the length of any tuples a and b such that $B_i = V_{a,b}$ for some i. Let $\alpha' = (x(1), \ldots, x(n-1))$. Then any $*$-monomial B' in the B_i's is equal to some $V_{a,b}$ with $\mathrm{length}(a) = \mathrm{length}(b) \leq n-1$, and therefore $g_{B'} \equiv 0$ or $g_{B'} \equiv 1$ on $X_{\alpha'}$. Taking linear combinations shows that g_B is also constant on $X_{\alpha'}$. Moreover, since $x \in X_{\alpha'}$ and $|g_B(x)| > g_A(x)/2$, it follows that $|g_B| > g_A(x)/2$ on $X_{\alpha'}$, and this implies that $g_A > 0$ on $X_{\alpha'}$.

Next, since $\mathcal{Q}$ is countable we can find $r \in \mathbf{R}$ such that $a(n) \neq r$ whenever $P_a \in \mathcal{Q}$ and $n \leq \mathrm{length}(a)$, and $a(n), b(n) \neq r$ whenever $V_{a,b} \in \mathcal{Q}$ and $n \leq \mathrm{length}(a) = \mathrm{length}(b)$. Let α be the n-tuple which extends α' and satisfies $\alpha(n) = r$. We claim that for any element C of the C*-algebra generated by $\mathcal{Q}$, the function g_C is constant on X_α and $\langle C\chi_y, \chi_z\rangle = 0$ for all distinct $y, z \in X_\alpha$. If C is a $*$-monomial in elements of $\mathcal{Q}$ then C is a partial isometry, $C = V_{a',b'}$, with $a'(n), b'(n) \neq r$ or $a'(n), b'(n)$ not defined, either of which implies the claim. The claim then holds for $*$-polynomials by linearity and in general by continuity.

In particular, the claim holds for $C = A$, so that $P_\alpha A P_\alpha$ is a scalar multiple of P_α. But we showed above that $g_A > 0$ on $X_{\alpha'} \supset X_\alpha$, so in fact $P_\alpha A P_\alpha$ is a nonzero scalar multiple of P_α, and hence $P_\alpha \in \mathcal{I}$.

Let $\mathcal{J}$ be any other nonzero closed, two-sided ideal of $\mathcal{A}$. By similar reasoning we can find some $P_\beta \in \mathcal{J}$. Now the pair (P_α, P_β) belongs to $\mathcal{W}_1$, so we have $\phi_1(\sigma) = (P_\alpha, P_\beta)$ for some $\sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}$. Let a_σ and b_σ be as in Section 1. Then a_σ and b_σ properly extend α and β, respectively, so $P_{a_\sigma} < P_\alpha$ and $P_{b_\sigma} < P_\beta$, and therefore $P_{a_\sigma} \in \mathcal{I}$ and $P_{b_\sigma} \in \mathcal{J}$. Furthermore, the partial isometry V_σ satisfies $V_\sigma P_{a_\sigma} V_\sigma^* = P_{b_\sigma}$. Thus $P_{b_\sigma} \in \mathcal{I} \cap \mathcal{J}$. This shows that $\mathcal{A}$ is prime. ∎

Lemma 2. *Let ρ be a state on $\mathcal{A}$. Then there is a 1-tuple $a \in \mathbf{R}^1$ such that ρ vanishes on the ideal generated by P_a.*

Proof. For each $n \in \mathbf{N}$, the projections P_b are orthogonal as b ranges over $\mathbf{R}^n$. Therefore ρ is nonzero on only countably many members of each $\mathcal{U}_n$. It follows that the set

$$Z = \{P_b \in \mathcal{U} : \rho(P_b) \neq 0\}$$

is countable. Thus $Z \in \mathcal{W}_2$ and we have $Z = \phi_2(\sigma)$ for some $\sigma < 2^{\aleph_0}$. Fix this value of σ, let S be the set of all values $a_\tau(1)$ and $b_\tau(1)$ such that $\tau \leq \sigma$, and let T be the set of all values $c(1)$ such that $P_c \in \phi_2(\sigma)$. Then define a 1-tuple a by letting $a(1)$ be any element of $\mathbf{R}$ which avoids S and T.

We will show that ρ vanishes on the ideal generated by P_a. The main step is the following claim: for any finite product A of elements of $\mathcal{U} \cup \mathcal{V} \cup \mathcal{V}^*$ at least one of which is P_a, there exist $n \in \mathbf{N}$ and $b \in \mathbf{R}^n$ such that

(1) $P_b A = A$,
(2) $a_\tau(n) \neq b(n)$ and $b_\tau(n) \neq b(n)$ for all $\tau \leq \sigma$ such that $n \leq n_\tau$, and
(3) $c(n) \neq b(n)$ for all $P_c \in \phi_2(\sigma)$ such that $n \leq \mathrm{length}(c)$.

We will assume $A \neq 0$. In the base case, for a product of length 1 we have $A = P_a$ and we can take $b = a$ and $n = 1$. Property (1) is trivial, and (2) and (3) follow directly from the definition of a. Now suppose the induction hypothesis holds for all products of length at most k and let A be a product of length $k + 1$. If the leftmost factor of A is P_a then we can still take $b = a$ and $n = 1$. Otherwise, write $A = CB$ where $C \in \mathcal{U} \cup \mathcal{V} \cup \mathcal{V}^*$ and B is a product of length k which includes P_a as a factor. Let b and n satisfy (1) – (3) for B. If $C \in \mathcal{U}$ then b and n also satisfy (1) – (3) for A, so assume $C \in \mathcal{V} \cup \mathcal{V}^*$. Without significant loss of generality we can suppose $C = V_\kappa$ for some $\kappa < 2^{\aleph_0}$.

Let a_κ and b_κ be as in Section 1. If $n > n_\kappa$ then $\mathrm{length}(a_\kappa) < \mathrm{length}(b)$, and $CB = A \neq 0$ and $P_b B = B$ then imply that b is an extension of a_κ. (Otherwise the cokernel of $C = V_\kappa$, namely $l^2(X_{a_\kappa})$, would be orthogonal to $l^2(X_b)$ and hence to the range of B.) Then $C(l^2(X_b)) = l^2(X_{b'})$ where b' is b with the initial a_κ segment replaced by b_κ. Thus $\mathrm{length}(b') = \mathrm{length}(b)$ and $b'(n) = b(n)$, and b' and n satisfy (1) – (3) for A. Property (1) holds because

$$P_{b'} A = P_{b'} CB = C P_b B = CB = A,$$

and properties (2) and (3) hold because $b'(n) = b(n)$.

Finally, suppose $n \leq n_\kappa$. If $\kappa \leq \sigma$ then by property (2) we have $a_\kappa(n) \neq b(n)$. This implies that X_{a_κ} is disjoint from X_b, so that $l^2(X_{a_\kappa})$ is orthogonal to $l^2(X_b)$ and hence $A = CB = V_\kappa P_b B$ is zero just as in the last paragraph, contradicting our assumption. So we must have $\kappa > \sigma$. Then b_κ and n_κ satisfy (1) – (3) for A: property (1) holds since P_{b_κ} is the range projection of C, and properties (2) and (3) follow from property (iii) in the original definition of a_κ and b_κ together with the fact that $\sigma < \kappa$. This completes the proof of the claim.

Now let A be any finite product of elements of $\mathcal{U} \cup \mathcal{V} \cup \mathcal{V}^*$, at least one of which is P_a, and let b be as in the claim. Since $Z = \phi_2(\sigma)$, property (3) implies that $P_b \notin Z$, i.e., $\rho(P_b) = 0$. It follows from the Cauchy-Schwarz inequality for positive functionals [3, Theorem 3.1.3] that

$$|\rho(A)|^2 = |\rho(P_b A)|^2 \leq \rho(P_b)\rho(A^*A) = 0,$$

and hence $\rho(A) = 0$. We have therefore shown that ρ vanishes on any finite product of elements of $\mathcal{U} \cup \mathcal{U} \cup \mathcal{V}^*$, at least one of which is P_a. Taking linear combinations shows that ρ vanishes on any $*$-polynomial in elements of $\mathcal{U}$ and $\mathcal{V}$ every term of which involves P_a, and by continuity ρ then vanishes on the ideal generated by P_a. ∎

Theorem. *The C^*-algebra $\mathcal{A}$ is prime but not primitive.*

Proof. $\mathcal{A}$ is prime by Lemma 1. Now let $\pi : \mathcal{A} \to B(K)$ be an irreducible representation on a Hilbert space K and let $\xi \in K$ be a unit vector. Then $\rho(A) = \langle \pi(A)\xi, \xi \rangle$ defines a state on $\mathcal{A}$. By Lemma 2, there is a nonzero ideal $\mathcal{I}$ on which ρ vanishes. Then

$$\langle \pi(A)\pi(B)\xi, \pi(C)\xi \rangle = \langle \pi(C^*AB)\xi, \xi \rangle = \rho(C^*AB) = 0$$

for all $A \in \mathcal{I}$ and $B, C \in \mathcal{A}$. Since π is irreducible ξ is cyclic, so this implies that $\pi(A) = 0$ for all $A \in \mathcal{I}$. Thus π is not faithful, and we conclude that $\mathcal{A}$ is not primitive. ∎

[1] J. Dixmier, Sur les C*-algèbres, *Bull. Soc. Math. France* **88** (1960), 95-112.

[2] I. Kaplansky, The structure of certain operator algebras, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **70** (1951), 219-255.

[3] G. K. Pedersen, *C*-Algebras and Their Automorphism Groups*, Academic Press (1979).

Math Dept.
Washington University
St. Louis, MO 63130
nweaver@math.wustl.edu